Alternative usage of common feeding grounds by large predators: the case of two hakes (Merluccius hubbsi and M. australis) in the southwest Atlantic

Alexander I. Arkhipkin a,*, David A.J. Middleton a, Julio M. Portela b, Jose M. Bellido b

a Fisheries Department, Falkland Islands Government (FIFD), P.O. Box 598, Stanley, Falkland Islands
b Instituto Español de Oceanografía (IEO), P.O. Box 1552, 36200 Vigo, Spain

Received 11 January 2003; accepted 30 June 2003

Abstract

Monthly variations in spatial and depth distributions, sex ratios, and maturity status in two species of hakes, Merluccius hubbsi and M. australis, were analysed in an area where their ranges overlap spatially on the shelf and slope around the Falkland Islands, and in international waters at 45–47° S (High Seas), using data collected by scientific observers on commercial fishing vessels. A variety of exploratory analyses were carried out on the raw data before patterns were quantified using generalised additive models. Both species use the areas studied as their feeding grounds. M. australis occur mainly on the Falkland shelf south of 51° S, whereas M. hubbsi is widely distributed throughout both the Falkland and High Seas shelf areas. Preliminary schemes of the seasonal migrations of both hakes in Falkland waters and on the High Seas are suggested and discussed. M. hubbsi and M. australis are found to be strongly segregated, both spatially and temporally, on their common feeding grounds, thus avoiding potential inter-specific competition for food resources.

© 2003 Published by Elsevier SAS.

Résumé


© 2003 Published by Elsevier SAS.

Keywords: Distribution; Hakes; Merluccius hubbsi; Merluccius australis; Southwest Atlantic

1. Introduction

Hakes (Merluccidae) are abundant nektonic fishes inhabiting shelf and continental slope waters of the Atlantic Ocean, eastern Pacific, and south-western Pacific off New Zealand (Cohen et al., 1990). These voracious predators make diurnal vertical migrations concentrating near the bottom during the daytime and ascending into pelagic layers at night (Inada, 1981). Most hake species make seasonal spatial migrations moving inshore, and to lower latitudes, to spawn in summer.
and moving back offshore, and to higher latitudes, to their feeding grounds in winter (Pitcher and Alheit, 1995).

Two hake species occur on the shelf and slope of the southwest Atlantic: southern hake *Merluccius australis* (Hutton, 1872) and common hake *Merluccius hubbsi* (Marini, 1933). Both hakes are subject to traditional trawling and longline fisheries in Chile, Argentina, Uruguay and the Falkland Islands (Cisirke, 1987). Southern hake occur along the Chilean coast in the eastern Pacific south of 40° S, around Cape Horn, and on the Patagonian Shelf north to 49° S. Common hake, in contrast, inhabit only Atlantic waters off South America: the Patagonian and Argentine Shelves between 28° and 54° S (Cohen et al., 1990). Little information is available on the variation in population structure across the species' range and on the seasonal migrations undertaken by hakes. Direct studies of migrations have proven to be difficult: tagging experiments have resulted in high mortality of tagged fish (Jones, 1974). Migrations have, therefore, only been studied indirectly by analyses of the seasonal distribution of the catch and effort of the hake fleet that target hake throughout the year and follow the seasonal movements of hake schools on the shelf (Podesta, 1990).

The patterns of seasonal migration in the common hake, *M. hubbsi*, have only been studied in detail in its northern populations (Podesta, 1990; Aubone et al., 2000), which move in autumn from their spawning grounds (inshore waters between the San Matías and San Jorge Gulfs) northwards to their feeding grounds on the shelf edge near the frontal zone between the Brazil and Falkland Currents. Here, they over-winter before returning to the spawning grounds in spring (Podesta, 1990). Movements of the southern populations of common hake are much less clear. It is assumed that they migrate, from spawning grounds in the San Jorge Gulf, offshore to the east and south-east and over-winter on the southern part of the Patagonian Shelf (Otero, 1986).

Based on studies of parasitological markers and morphology, George-Nascimento and Arancibia (1994) proposed that southern hake, *M. australis*, migrate from their inshore spawning grounds at 49° S in the Pacific along the Chilean coast to the south-east, negotiate Cape Horn, and enter feeding grounds on the southern part of the Patagonian shelf. Thus, the shelf and continental slope waters around the Falkland Islands are used as feeding grounds by both *M. hubbsi* and *M. australis*.

The primary aim of this study is to investigate spatial and temporal patterns, in the distributions of the two hake species, on their common feeding grounds on the shelf around the Falkland Islands and in international waters at 45–47° S, and to develop a conceptual model of their seasonal movements. Catch data from commercial vessels are used to investigate the species, distributions, whilst data on changes in the biological status help to clarify the reasons for observed changes in distribution.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Data sources

Since the introduction of regulated fisheries around the Falklands in 1987, all licensed vessels fishing in the Falkland Islands Interim Conservation and Management Zone (FICZ) and Falklands Outer Conservation Zone (FOCZ) have submitted daily catch reports to the Falkland Islands Fisheries Department (FID). In addition, Falklands registered vessels report their catches when they are working outside the Falklands zones. Historically, trawlers fishing in the FICZ have reported just the total catch of both hakes together making it impossible to separate by species (Tingley et al., 1995).

Reporting of pooled catches is a common practice in hake fisheries in regions where two (*M. capensis* and *M. paradoxus*, South Africa) or three (*M. merluccius*, *M. senegalensis* and *M. polli*, northwest Africa) hake species are encountered in catches (Punt, 1992; Martos and Peralta, 1995). As a result of this pooled reporting of the total catch of hakes by commercial trawlers, only data collected by scientific observers placed on board commercial fishing vessels have been used in this study. Data from two observer programmes were available. FID places observers on a subset of commercial fishing vessels licensed to fish in the Falklands zones. The Instituto Español de Oceanografía (IEO) places observers on a subset of Spanish flagged vessels fishing in the southwest Atlantic.

Data from FID observers were available from January 1988 to February 2002. During this period, data were collected from 12 489 demersal trawls. *M. hubbsi* was recorded in 5625 of these hauls and *M. australis* in 2150. The IEO data set comprised 5537 demersal trawls with hake catches in the period February 1989–December 1999. *M. hubbsi* was recorded in 5469 trawls and *M. australis* in 818.

*M. australis* and *M. hubbsi* can be difficult to distinguish (Cousseau and Cotrina, 1980). Preliminary analysis of the length data suggested that a significant proportion of identifications of *M. australis* by IEO observers may be doubtful. Although this issue has been addressed recently by the IEO observer programme, the analyses of *M. australis* presented here use only data from FID observers. Furthermore, records of *M. australis* from 102 trawls analysed by FID observers were also excluded due to uncertainties in identification. Two sets of data on common hake *M. hubbsi* (FID and IEO) were used in the present study as they covered different localities: Falkland Zones (mainly FID) and international waters (mainly IEO).

The trawl fishery for hakes, both in the FICZ and in the High Seas region (i.e. in international waters between 45° and 47°30' S), takes place throughout the year. Trawls are usually several hours in duration. The stretched mesh size in the trawl codend for vessels working within the FICZ is restricted to 90 mm by license conditions (FID, 2001).

Both FID and IEO observers typically sampled two trawls a day, recording catch weight by species together with
the trawl start position and average trawling depth. Length-frequency samples were taken when possible comprising a random sample of about 100 specimens (or the total catch if there were less than 100 fish in a given trawl). Each individual was measured (total length, to the nearest 1 cm below) and its sex recorded. FIFD observers also recorded the maturity of specimens in length-frequency samples using an eight-stage maturity scale modified from the seven-stage Nikolsky (1963) scale with stage III split into two stages (early and late maturation). IEO observers used a five-stage maturity scale and recorded maturities during size stratified sampling only. Analysis of maturity presented here used only FIFD observer data, as it was impossible to match the two sets of maturity data.

The vessels on which observers are placed may be subject to license conditions that restrict the species that may be targeted. Within the Falklands zones there are fisheries for the longfin squid *Loligo gahi*, shortfin squid *Illex argentinus*, skates and rays, and finfish. Some finfish licensed boats are restricted from targeting hakes, and certain areas are closed to certain license types. We have considered only demersal trawls, as the gear type used is broadly similar across the fleets. In the analyses of spatial and depth distributions we have used data from all demersal trawls irrespective of license type. Data from research trawls carried out by the FIFD were also included.

### 2.2. Analyses of hake distributions

A variety of visualisation techniques were used to investigate the raw data. Maps were constructed by plotting trawl-by-trawl CPUE. This was chosen in preference to presenting gridded data for a number of reasons. More precise location of catches allows better comparison with features such as bathymetry, and both the average catch levels, and catch variability, can be assessed from the same maps. The location of trawls without hake catches recorded by FIFD observers were included to show the overall sampling effort in a particular month. Preliminary analyses showed little interannual variation in seasonal distributions, and it was decided to pool the data gathered over the study period.

To allow a quantitative comparison of monthly trends in the relative abundance of the two species in different regions the data were split geographically. For *M. australis* data were restricted to the Falklands zones south of 47.5° S and were split into quadrants, north and south of 51° S, and east and west of 60° W. For *M. hubbsi* three regions were considered: the High Seas region (44.5–47.5° S), and the northern (47.5–51° S) and southern (south of 51° S) parts of the Falklands zones. For all trawls where hake were present the natural logarithm of CPUE (kg h⁻¹) was plotted for each month using notched boxplots: where the notches do not overlap, there is a significant difference in the medians at the 95% level (McGill et al., 1978).

The depth distribution of the two hakes was assessed using the FIFD data. The proportion of all observed trawls with a non-zero catch of each hake species was calculated for 50-m depth classes. The mean CPUE of each species was calculated for the same 50-m depth classes including both zero and non-zero hake catches. The co-occurrence of the two hake species was assessed by calculating the proportion of all trawls where both species were taken.

Following these exploratory analyses, generalised additive models (GAMs) were used to quantify the presence and abundance of the two hakes. The two-stage Delta-Gamma or Delta-Lognormal approach (Stefansson, 1996 and references therein) was employed. This involves first fitting a model with a binomial response to describe the presence/absence of each species of hake in the trawls, then fitting a second model, with a Gamma or Lognormal response, to model the CPUE of hake in those trawls where they occurred. The GAMs included the following explanatory variables: smooth functions of spatial position and depth, and factors for year, month and license type. As license type was only applicable to trawls from the Falklands zones, a pseudo-license type was assigned to research and high seas trawls. We consider spatial position to be a two-dimensional smooth function of latitude and longitude, following Bowman and Azzalini (1997).
GAMs were fitted using the version 0.8.6 of the mGCV package (Wood, 2000) in the version 1.6.1 of the R statistical environment (Ihaka and Gentleman, 1996). This package fits the GAMs using Generalised Cross Validation (GCV) or an Un-Biased Risk Estimator (UBRE), and the decision, on whether to retain a particular explanatory variable in the model, was made on the basis of comparing the GCV/UBRE score with and without the variable. Parametric, rather than smooth, forms of some variables were also considered.

2.3. Analyses of biological trends

Overall length-frequency distributions were constructed using data pooled over all years. For *M. australis* only the FIFD observer data were used: length-frequency samples were available from 329 trawls with a total of 9479 individuals sampled. FIFD and IEO data were pooled to construct separate distributions for *M. hubbsi* in the FICZ (1430 trawls/94 683 individuals sampled) and in the High Seas region (1038 trawls/109 396 individuals sampled). GAMs were used to investigate differences in size by sex, area, and year.

Sex ratios were estimated on a monthly basis. For trawls where more than 20 individuals were sexed, GAMs were again used to explore the trawl-by-trawl variation in sex ratio in relation to month, year, and trawl depth. The proportion of females in a trawl sample was modelled, using a logit link function.

The monthly distribution of maturity stages was calculated, using the FIFD random samples only, for both *M. australis* and *M. hubbsi*.

3. Results

3.1. *Merluccius australis*

3.1.1. Distribution

*M. australis* occurred in all areas sampled by FIFD observers over the period 1988–2001, with the majority of records coming from the deeper shelf (200–500 m) in the southwest of the FICZ (Fig. 1a). *M. australis* was also sometimes encountered over the shallower shelf in the northwest of the FICZ and around the 200-m contour, including some recorded occurrences in international waters as far north as 45° S.

The monthly pattern of CPUE demonstrates that the distribution of *M. australis* within the FICZ varies through the year (Figs. 2 and 3). Trawlers in January found *M. australis* mainly to the west of the Falkland Islands at depths greater than 200 m. In February, CPUE increased in the southwestern part of the FICZ and *M. australis* also appeared as by-catch in south-eastern region where the fishery for *L. gahi* takes place, along the 200-m depth contour to the south and east of the Islands, and on the shelf in the north-west of FICZ. The highest CPUEs in March and April were found in trawls south of the 200-m contour in the west of FICZ. In May,
catches were concentrated on the western edge of FICZ. *M. australis* was largely absent from trawls carried out in Falkland waters in June and July. It appeared again in trawls within FICZ in August and September with high CPUEs being recorded in the southwest of the FICZ at 53° S close to the 500-m depth contour. In October and November, CPUEs were relatively high over the deeper shelf area (>200 m) in the southwest and west of the FICZ, and CPUE also increased to the south-east and north-west of the Islands. In spite of a relatively small number of sampled trawls in December, it is apparent that *M. australis* still occurred in the western part of FICZ at this time (Fig. 2).

The distribution of *M. australis* catches by depth is bimodal with the greatest occurrence, and highest average CPUE, in trawls between 400 and 500 m depths. Southern hake occurred only rarely in trawls in shallow waters, but was fairly common in trawls at 300–350 m depths (Fig. 4a).

A series of generalised additive models were constructed for the presence of *M. australis* in trawls and its CPUE in trawls when present (Table 1). In models for the presence of *M. australis* the UBRE score indicated that license type could be eliminated and the effect of year included simply as a linear parametric term. The smooth terms in this model (Fig. 5a) demonstrate that *M. australis* is much more likely to be encountered in trawls in the southern, and particularly the south-western, part of the region, and that it is more likely to occur in deeper trawls. The effect of month is less strong, indicating a decreased likelihood of occurrence in trawls after mid-April, and only a slight increase in the latter part of the year.

All explanatory variables were retained in the model of CPUE in trawls where *M. australis* occurred. Use of log-normal distribution proved more satisfactory than a gamma distribution for the CPUE data. The effect of position and depth on *M. australis* CPUE was similar to the effect on its presence (Fig. 6a). CPUEs are higher in the south-western part of the region studied and at depths around 450 m. The

![Fig. 3. Boxplots of monthly haul-by-haul CPUE (ln kg h⁻¹) in trawls with non-zero catches for *M. australis* in four regions of the Falklands zones: north/south of 51° S, and east/west of 69° W. The superimposed line indicates the monthly mean log CPUE.](image)

![Fig. 4. Proportion of all bottom trawls recorded by FIFD observers with catches of southern hake *M. australis* (A) and common hake *M. hubbsi* (C). Trawls are grouped in 50 m depth classes labelled at the class midpoint. The total number of trawls in each depth class is given in parenthesis. The depth distribution of average CPUE of *M. australis* and *M. hubbsi* over all observed trawls is given in (B) and (D), respectively.](image)

![Fig. 5. Depth class (Number of trawls)](image)

![Fig. 6. Depth class (Average CPUE)](image)

### 3.1.2. Length-frequency composition

The length distribution of both sexes of southern hake from the pooled samples was essentially unimodal with a slight left skew (Fig. 7a). The modal size of sampled females was slightly larger than that of males (73 and 71 cm, respectively). A small mode of 42 cm was evident in the male length distribution. No fish smaller than 38 cm were caught. A GAM expressing length in terms of sex and a smooth function of year accounted for 15.5% of the null deviance in size and demonstrated that the difference between the size of male and female *M. australis* in the Falklands data were not significant ($P = 0.82$). Inter-annual variation in the size of fish was apparent ($P < 0.0001$), though there was no dominant trend over the period.

### 3.1.3. Sex ratio

Females predominated in catches throughout the year (Fig. 8a). They made up between 73% and 83% of sexed individuals in January–May. The peak proportion of females observed in August (81%), dropped to 64% in September, then trended upwards to 73% in December. No samples were available in June and July. A GAM model incorporating smooth functions of month, year and depth accounted for...
Table 1
GCV/UBRE scores and percent of null deviance explained in a sequence of generalised additive models of the presence of *M. australis* and *M. hubbsi* in trawls and CPUE in trawls where the species was present. The full suite of explanatory variables was position (2D smooth of latitude and longitude), depth, month, year and license type. In all cases the full model containing all explanatory variables was compared with models where each variable was eliminated in turn. The final models considered are indicated by bold type.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Explanatory variables</th>
<th>GCV/UBRE * score</th>
<th>Deviance explained (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Presence of <em>M. australis</em>—binomial</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>0.255</td>
<td>38.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>0.183</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>0.287</td>
<td>37.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Month</td>
<td>0.219</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>0.083</td>
<td>35.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type</td>
<td>0.073</td>
<td>36.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License year</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>32.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type year parametric</td>
<td><strong>0.008</strong></td>
<td><strong>34.4</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPUE of <em>M. australis</em>—lognormal</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td>1.242</td>
<td>70.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>1.432</td>
<td>65.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>1.268</td>
<td>69.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Month</td>
<td>1.331</td>
<td>68.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>1.346</td>
<td>67.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type</td>
<td>1.396</td>
<td>66.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of <em>M. hubbsi</em>—binomial</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>0.057</td>
<td>35.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>0.035</td>
<td>24.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>0.090</td>
<td>34.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Month</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>25.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>0.034</td>
<td>33.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>33.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License year</td>
<td><strong>0.011</strong></td>
<td><strong>32.3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type year parametric</td>
<td>0.013</td>
<td>32.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPUE of <em>M. hubbsi</em>—lognormal</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td>1.778</td>
<td>66.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>2.302</td>
<td>55.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>1.807</td>
<td>65.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Month</td>
<td>2.290</td>
<td>56.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>1.982</td>
<td>62.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>License type</td>
<td>1.865</td>
<td>64.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The mgCV package uses UBRE in cases in which the scale parameter is assumed known, i.e. in the binomial model for presence/absence.*

55.7% of the null deviance in the proportion of females in the trawl-by-trawl data. The fitted smooth functions are illustrated in Fig. 9a. The increase in the proportion of females present in August is reflected in a peak in the monthly component for the proportion of females, although the lack of samples from June and July implies some caution is required in interpreting this fit. There are indications of an upward trend in the proportion of females from 1993 onwards. However, the confidence intervals are wide and only limited samples are available from the late 1990s. In contrast, samples are well spread over the 150–500 m depth range and it is clear that the proportion of females generally reduces with increased depth.

3.1.4. Maturity

Immature (maturity stage 1) fish, when present, occurred only in very small proportions (Fig. 10a). In spring (August–November) post-spawning adult fish, both males and females, were present. In December–January only resting or early-developing females were present, although several mature males were recorded in these months. From February to May, a general increase in the maturity of both females and males was apparent. Mature females were detected in very small proportions in catches from the Falklands zones. Mature males were recorded, albeit as a generally small proportion of the catch, throughout the year.

3.2. *Merluccius hubbsi*

3.2.1. Distribution

*M. hubbsi* was widespread at depths between 150 and 300 m over the shelf and shelf edge around the Falkland Islands and in the High Seas region (Fig. 1b). It was present in a significant number of trawls in the area to the south-east of the Islands where the *L. gahi* fishery takes place (Figs. 2 and 11). The occurrence in catches and CPUE by depth showed that this species was most abundant in trawls at 150–250 m depths (Fig. 4c,d). *M. hubbsi* was also recorded in trawls in shallower (<150 m) waters near the Falklands.

Only about 20% of trawls with hake yielded a simultaneous catch of both species in any month and, where they did
Fig. 5. Plots of the smooth terms included in generalised additive models for the presence of (A) *M. australis* and (B) *M. hubbsi*.

co-occur, *M. hubbsi* usually comprised a much larger proportion of the catch than *M. australis* (Fig. 12).

The distribution of *M. hubbsi* CPUE within the FICZ and in the High Seas region varied substantially through the year (Figs. 2 and 11). In January, *M. hubbsi* was essentially absent from trawls in Falkland waters and only small catches (mean CPUE of 144 kg h⁻¹ in trawls with *M. hubbsi*) were taken in the shallower waters of the northern part of the High Seas region. In February, common hake appeared in catches in the southern (deeper water) part of the High Seas region and also occurred further south (to 47°30′ S). In Falkland waters, they were first encountered in the western part of FICZ, and the north of the FOCZ, near the 200-m depth contour. In March, *M. hubbsi* occurred widely in trawls in the northern part of the FICZ and mean CPUE in the High Seas region increased to 488 kg h⁻¹. The highest catches in April and May occurred south of the 200-m contour in the west of the FICZ and on the High Seas. *M. hubbsi* was present around the Falkland Islands in winter (June–August), but the highest winter catches were observed on the High Seas. In August–September, *M. hubbsi* was still caught widely in the west and north of the FICZ, but was largely absent from the south-eastern area of FICZ. In October, CPUEs were relatively low over the entire Falkland shelf, but high CPUEs were still observed on the High Seas. In November–December, in spite of a significant number of trawls, *M. hubbsi* was not recorded around the Islands and mean CPUE at 45–46° S decreased to 350 kg h⁻¹ in trawls with *M. hubbsi* from the peak of 713 kg h⁻¹ observed in April–August.

Fig. 6. Plots of the smooth terms included in generalised additive models for the CPUE of (A) *M. australis* and (B) *M. hubbsi* in the subset of trawls where the species was present.

The most satisfactory GAM model for the presence of *M. hubbsi* omits year and license type as explanatory variables (Table 1). The likelihood of *M. hubbsi* occurring in a trawl is highest in the north-west of the region and peaks at around 250 m depth (Fig. 5b). There is a strong seasonal relationship, with the highest likelihood of occurrence in June. A GAM with a lognormal distribution again proved more satisfactory than a gamma distribution in describing the CPUE of *M. hubbsi* in trawls where it was present. All explanatory variables proved useful. Plots of the smooth variables (Fig. 6b) show a similar pattern to those in the model for the presence of *M. hubbsi*, namely higher CPUE in the north-west of the region and at intermediate depths (250–300 m). CPUEs are also strongly seasonal, peaking in May–June. As with *M. australis*, there is a generally decreasing trend in CPUE from 1988 to 2002, although the peaks and troughs in the smoothed year effect are out of phase with those in *M. australis*.

3.2.2. Length-frequency composition

The pooled length distribution of *M. hubbsi* was unimodal for both sexes, both in the FICZ and on the High Seas. The
modal size of both males and females was about 3 cm larger in the FICZ than on the High Seas. Common hake were sexually dimorphic in size. The modal size of females in both regions was 4–5 cm larger than that of males (Fig. 7b,c). A GAM expressing length in terms of sex, region (Falklands zones vs. High Seas) and a smooth of year confirmed a significant difference in the size of male and female *M. hubbsi* (P < 0.0001). The two regions also showed a significant (P < 0.0001) difference in fish length with larger fish occurring in the Falklands zones. For both sexes in both regions there were again significant (P < 0.0001) inter-annual variations in mean size, but as in *M. australis* there was no particular trend in size over the period.

### 3.2.3. Sex ratio

In the Falkland waters, females predominated in catches of common hake throughout the year. Their proportion decreased from almost complete dominance in January (95%) to 80–85% in February–May, followed by a gradual increase from 90% in June to almost 100% in November (Fig. 8b). On the High Seas, the overall proportion of females was lower than that in Falkland waters. The proportion of females peaked in March and then again in October–November (Fig. 8c). Exploratory GAM models were fitted to the data from the Falklands zones and High Seas region separately. The sex ratio in the Falkland waters is heavily female biased and 16.9% of trawls sampled yielded exclusively females, in contrast to just 1.9% in the High Seas region. In Falkland waters (Fig. 9b) the smooth components fitted in the GAM models suggest there is rather little variation in sex ratio from month to month, in contrast with the High Seas region (Fig. 9c) where the proportion of females peaks in September/October. In both areas, there are indications of a slight upward trend in the proportion of females through the 1990s; however, this is variable and confidence intervals are large. In Falkland waters, the model fit suggests a decrease in the proportion of females in deeper water, whilst the opposite is the case in the High Seas region. In both cases, however, the vast majority of samples are from shallower trawls (<250 m in Falkland waters, <150 m in the High Seas region). Consequently, confidence intervals are large and the trends cannot be considered clear.

### 3.2.4. Maturity

In Falkland waters, immature fish (maturity stage I) were found to be present in very small proportions throughout the year. In summer (January–February) from 10% to 25% of both males and females were in spawning condition, whereas about a half had resting gonads (Fig. 10b). In March–May, spawning animals disappeared from catches, followed by post-spawning females and males. A high proportion of preparatory females (stage IV) and preparatory and spawning males were observed in July and August, followed by a prevalence of fishes with resting gonads (stages II and III) in September–November. On the High Seas, the occurrence of immature fishes was much higher than in Falkland waters.
Fig. 8. Proportions of females (black bars) and males (white bars) in all sexed individuals of *M. australis* (A, FIFD data) and *M. hubbsi* in the FICZ (B, FIFD and IEO data) and in the High Seas region (C, FIFD and IEO data) on a monthly basis, using pooled length-frequency samples from 1988 to 2002. The number of individuals is given in parenthesis beneath the abscissa.

(Fig. 10c). A high proportion of females was in resting condition from January through June. In July–September, most females were maturing. Trends in the maturities of males were similar to those of females, but with a higher occurrence of maturing animals. Unlike females, about half of the males sampled were mature in June. Unfortunately, the small number of animals sampled in December in Falkland waters, with none from the High Seas, prevented the gaining of a clear picture of the maturity status of *M. hubbsi* at the end of the year.

Taking into account the high abundance of females, it was possible to distinguish three periods in the maturity status of *M. hubbsi* both in Falkland waters and on the High Seas. The post-spawning period ran from March to June while the resting/feeding period occurred from July to November. The spawning period, when the majority of fish were absent from Falkland waters and the High Seas, was from December to February. However, this picture was not as clear as with *M. australis*, because quite significant numbers of fish were either preparatory (mainly females) or even spawning (mainly males) in austral winter.

4. Discussion

The spatial overlap in the ranges of the hakes *M. hubbsi* and *M. australis* on the Patagonian shelf is well documented (Inada, 1981). Data obtained in the early 1980s suggested, however, that the southern (Patagonian) hake *M. australis* should dominate around the Falkland Islands (Csrke, 1987). After the establishment of the FICZ in 1987, it was recognised that the bulk of the hake catch in Falkland waters consisted of the common hake *M. hubbsi* (mean 91% in 1987–1991) (Tingley et al., 1995). Our data show that the spatial overlap, in the distributions of the two hakes, is largely limited to the shelf and continental slope areas south of 51° S whilst shelf and slope areas north of 51° S, are occupied almost exclusively by common hake.

Only a very small proportion of *M. australis* and a small proportion of *M. hubbsi* females have been found with gonads in spawning condition. This confirms that neither species spawns around the Falkland Islands, as assumed by Tingley et al. (1995). Although a larger proportion of mature males than females were observed in some months within the FICZ in both species, this does not necessarily imply the
occurrence of spawning. Males start maturing earlier than females, sometimes at the end of their time on the feeding grounds (i.e. *M. australis* from New Zealand waters; Coleman, 1995). Thus, waters around the Falkland Islands represent the feeding ground of both hake species.

The use of trawl data from two observer programs, spanning a 15-year period and a variety of fisheries, provides considerably wider spatial and temporal coverage than is normally the case with scientific survey data. However, the inference of distribution patterns from commercial data, rather than scientific survey data, obviously requires some caution. The location of commercial trawls is influenced by a variety of considerations including license conditions (restricted species and closed areas), vessel capabilities, commercial priorities and the knowledge and experience of the crew. Within a particular locality, fish behaviour (e.g. schooling leading to distinctive acoustic traces) may allow the targeting of particular species. This has implications for the comparability of catch rates as the resulting hake catches include by-catch in addition to targeted trawls. GAMs can provide a useful means of standardising commercial CPUE data for these differing vessel effects (e.g. Denis et al., 2002) quantifying the patterns found the exploratory analyses of spatial and temporal trends in the raw distribution data. Standardisation for the varying commercial priorities and restrictions noted above is via the incorporation of a factor representing the license type held by the vessel. In fact, license type was retained as a useful explanatory variable only in the models of CPUE of the two hakes, not in the models of presence/absence. This suggests that different fishing practices can affect the catch rate of hakes, but not to
the extent of total avoidance. This is intuitively reasonable for fish dispersed on their feeding grounds rather than aggregated in easily identified schools.

When carrying out statistical standardisation of CPUE data it is, of course, necessary to be aware of the limitations of that data. For example, the shelf area to the south-east of the Falklands is only open to trawlers targeting L. gahi. There is only a limited overlap between the fleets targeting L. gahi in the south-east and that targeting finfish in the western part of the Falklands zones so complete separation of the effects of fleet and area cannot be expected. Visualisation and basic analyses of the raw data thus remain important precursors to the use of generalised additive modelling.

The GAM terms, representing the overall effect of spatial position and depth on the presence and abundance of *M. australis* and *M. hubbsi*, provide a clear confirmation of the spatial separation of the two species. The presence/abundance of *M. hubbsi* are highest in the north-west of the region and peaks at depths of 200–300 m, whilst both presence and abundance of *M. australis* are greatest in the southwest of the study region and at depths of 400–500 m. The temporal pattern in the presence and abundance of *M. hubbsi*, which peaks in austral winter, is clearly demonstrated by the GAM smooth of month, while that of *M. australis* is rather less clear. Examination of the raw data suggests a noticeable drop in the abundance of *M. australis* in the region in June and July. However, this effect is only weakly represented by the smooth term for the effect of month on the presence of *M. australis* whilst the monthly term, in the GAM for abundance, suggests a simple decrease through the year. The limited data available from the southwest of the FICZ in June, July and December are certainly partly responsible for this paradox and fact that the seasonal pattern the presence and abundance of *M. australis* remains rather less clear than that of *M. hubbsi* at present.

By supplementing the analyses of the spatial and temporal patterns, in the distributions of the two hakes with information on their biological status through the year, it has been possible to formulate preliminary schemes of their seasonal migrations in Falkland waters and the High Seas region (Fig. 13). In spring, post-spawning *M. australis* first arrive in the southwest of the FICZ concentrating initially in the deeper (400–500 m) waters around 53° S. Over the summer, the majority of *M. australis* are in resting condition and distributed over the deeper shelf in the south-western part of
FICZ, mainly at 200 and 500 m depths. It also disperses, to some extent, to the shallower shelf areas (~200 m) in the north-west of the zone and along the 200-m depth contour to the north-east and north of the Falkland Islands. In autumn, there is a slight increase in maturity and catch rates are the highest in the west of the FICZ just deeper than the 200-m contour. In May, animals are concentrated at the western edge of the FICZ around 52° S and our assumption is that they move out of Falkland waters at this time of year to spawn further to the south-west. To date, spawning grounds of *M. australis* are known only off the Pacific coast of Chile, where the main spawning area is located between 43° and 47° S and with secondary areas between 52° and 54° S (Aguayo-Hernandez, 1995). There spawning occurs from July to September, which coincides with the apparent absence of *M. australis* from Falkland waters. An analysis of individual morphometry and parasitological fauna, from fish caught near the Falklands and off southern Chile, suggested that fish from both regions belong to a single interbreeding population with several stock units (George-Nascimento and Arancibia, 1994).

Common hake *M. hubbsi* have a different migration pattern in Falkland waters than *M. australis*. In January, *M. hubbsi* is present in small numbers in the shallowest parts of the High Seas region and is absent from the FICZ. Fish migrate first into the western part of FICZ in February at depths around 200 m. In autumn (March–May), *M. hubbsi* is found in large numbers both on the High Seas and in the northern and western parts of FICZ. By May, it has penetrated to the southern and south-eastern parts of FICZ. *M. hubbsi* have their widest distribution in winter. In spring, they disappear first from the south-eastern parts of FICZ (in September) gradually moving in a north-westerly direction (in October). *M. hubbsi* disappear from the FICZ in November and from the High Seas region in December, presumably moving to their spawning grounds in inshore Argentine waters. The period of common hake absence from Falkland waters and the High Seas, and their maturity cycle, coincides with the spawning period of *M. hubbsi* in the San Jorge Gulf (December–February; Aubone et al., 2000).

Both *M. australis*, in Chilean waters and *M. hubbsi* in Argentine waters, have a substantial sexual dimorphism in growth rate with females growing faster, and attaining larger sizes, than males (Aguayo-Hernandez, 1995; Aubone et al., 2000). However, in waters around the Falkland Islands, this difference in size is not so pronounced, especially in *M. australis* where no significant difference in total size was detected. In hakes with long seasonal migrations, it is known that the larger fish usually migrate faster and farther than smaller fish (i.e. north Pacific hake *M. productus*) (Smith et al., 1990). Thus, a pronounced sexual dimorphism in fish size can affect the length compositions, sex ratios and age structure in different parts of the species’ range. Near the periphery of range of *M. productus*, large females predominate while smaller fish are found near the centre of the range (=spawning grounds) (Smith et al., 1990; Dorn, 1992). This is exactly the situation that occurs in both hake species in the southwest Atlantic. Near the spawning grounds of *M. hubbsi* smaller males predominate in catches (Bezzi et al., 1995). Only the larger males can migrate to the peripheries of the species range. As the proportion of large males in the overall length-frequency distribution is small, this leads to a prevalence of females, and to similar modal sizes of the sexes, in areas close to the peripheries of the species range. Thus, in the High Seas feeding grounds, *M. hubbsi* females are prevalent but the proportion of females, and the modal size of both sexes, are smaller than in the feeding grounds around the Falkland Islands which are more distant from the San Jorge Gulf spawning grounds. The same trend, in sex ratios and sizes of the sexes, is observed in *M. australis* on the Falkland shelf and slope. The increase in the proportion of females, in shallower waters in the Falklands zones, may represent another aspect of the differing migration ranges of the sexes—the shallow waters of the FICZ are further from the Pacific spawning grounds so may only be reached by the larger fish, which are mostly females. Females of another gadoid fish—Atlantic cod—also made feeding migrations farther from their spawning grounds than their male counterparts, creating female-dominated schools in the peripheries of their ranges, as demonstrated by the analysis of sex ratios (Morgan and Trippel, 1996) and acoustic tagging (Robichaud and Rose, 2003).

In spite of the recognised difficulty in distinguishing *M. australis* from *M. hubbsi* morphologically (Cousseau and Cotrina, 1980), it is clear that these species are segregated and occupy different spatial and temporal niches on their common feeding grounds on the shelf and slope around the Falkland Islands. They are segregated temporally, with different and non-overlapping spawning seasons—the austral winter in the case of *M. australis* and austral summer in *M. hubbsi*. During these periods, one species is absent, spawning outside Falkland waters, giving the other species the advantage of expanding its range to feed, without competition, on the feeding grounds of the Falklands shelf. In other seasons (spring and autumn), when both species are present on the Falklands shelf, they remain spatially segregated with *M. australis* occurring mainly in the south-western sector of the FICZ and *M. hubbsi* everywhere else. Where they do co-occur on the south-western part of the Falkland shelf, there is still a segregation by depth with *M. australis* occurring mainly on the shelf edge and slope deeper 300 m and *M. hubbsi* occurring on the shelf <250 m depth. The same depth segregation between two sympatric species of hakes is observed in South African waters between shallow water *M. capensis* and deep water *M. paradoxus* (Payne and Punt, 1995). The feeding spectrum of the two hakes on the Falkland Shelf is still unknown. However, studies of their feeding in other regions showed that *M. australis* is primarily a piscivorous predator, with southern blue whiting comprising a large part of their diet (Payá, 1992; Aguayo-Hernandez, 1995). Interestingly, the arrival of *M. australis* on the Falkland shelf coincides in time and space with the spawning
migrations of southern blue whiting, which aggregates to spawn on the shelf edge at 300–400 m on the slope south of Falklands in August–October (Shubnikov et al., 1969). After spawning, southern blue whiting disperses northwards in both directions along the shelf edge and southern hake again apparently follows some of these aggregations and, as a result, are encountered mainly in the deep-water area to the southwest of the Islands. In contrast, *M. hubbsi* is more opportunistic predator feeding on a variety of fishes and cephalopods (Anelescu and Prenske, 1987). *M. hubbsi* utilises the Falkland shelf more extensively than *M. australis* and is abundant everywhere including the south-eastern part of the Falkland Shelf up to 250 m depth. In winter, these areas of the Falkland Shelf are the main feeding grounds of the Patagonian longfin squid *L. gahi*, which aggregate in the warm intermediate water layer at 200–250 m depth at this time of the year. Here, they are targeted by a variety of nektic predators and exploited by the fishing fleet (Arkhipkin et al., 2003; Hatfield and des Cleres, 1998). Thus, it is likely that feeding spectra of both hakes around the Falklands are also different, further segregating their ecological niches. Studies of the diet of both hakes around the Islands are needed to clarify the ecological role they play in the ecosystem of the Patagonian and Falkland shelves.

Acknowledgements

This work is a product of the EU Study Project DG Fisheries No 99/016. We are grateful to the many FIFD and IEO observers who collected the data used here. Joost Pompert, Observer Coordinator at FIFD, assisted in resolving a number of data issues especially with regard to the reliability of *M. australis* identifications. We thank the FIFD Director of Fisheries, John Barton, for supporting this work. Dr. P. Pepin and two anonymous reviewers provided valuable comments on the earlier version of the manuscript, which is much appreciated.

References


